

File No. 18/4/2020- PRP&P
National Human Rights Commission
Bonded Labour / Research Section

Sub: Recommendation based on the visit report of Dr. Vinod Aggarwal, Special Rapporteur, NHRC to Lohardaga ,Jharkhand to evaluate the implementation of MG NREGA Scheme on 10th January, 2020.

Dr. Vinod Aggarwal, Special Rapporteur visited the Lohardaga state of Jharkhand on 10th January, 2020 to study the implementation of the MG NREGA scheme. He has submitted a general report regarding the realization of rural development schemes and how it has benefitted the agricultural labourers belonging to schedule caste and schedule tribe.

The observations and recommendations that emerged from the visit are mentioned below:

Observations/ Key Information obtained:

1. Population figures:

- i. Lohardaga, Jharkhand has population of 0.46 million out of which 0.40 million population resides in rural area and 13% in the urban area. Further, 3.4% are SCs (15330) and 56.89 % are STs (262734).
- ii. The number of marginal farmers as per 'District Agricultural Data' is 7903 families and number of agricultural laborers is 9127 respectively.

2. Man-days targets:

- I. The man-days target is 13.68 Lakh for the current financial year 2019 -20. As against the expected man-days target of 10.5 lakh to be achieved till January, 2020. However, the target is low but it can be considered satisfactory.
- II. The district has 7 blocks and till 10th January, 2020 69 % i.e. 6.89 lakh man days were created.
- III. Out of total man days generated in the current financial year, STs have done 4,27,744 (62%) of total man days and contribution to weaker section is about 62%.

- IV. The distribution of MG NREGA scheme states that the district has not increased beyond 83% of the target man days in last 6 years whereas in the year 2018-19 the achievement remained 75% only.
- V. One of the reasons for this could be the substantial difference in wages paid by labour department and wages paid by NREGA. Another reason could be the strike in the year 2018 by NREGA personnel and shortage of funds. More clarifications on the reasons for non-achievement of targets and relook into uniformity in work demanded of each labourer in all states are required.

3. Wages:

- i. In the year 2018-19, 77% of the payment is Adhaar based as the 87% Adhaar cards were linked and verified i.e. 63995 verified cards out of 73195.
- ii. In the year 2018-19, 90% of wages have been paid within 8 days of generation of muster roll and 8% of wages have been released within 15 days. However, 2% of wages has been paid after 15 days. Therefore, there is a need to examine these cases by the senior officer.

4. Job cards:

- i. The number of job cards produced in the year 2014 (68723) has increased to 73597 by the end of year 2018.
- ii. The number of active job cards in the year 2014 (63813) reduced to 47667 in the year 2018.
- iii. Out of 93% active job cards produced in the year 2014 only 65% job cards are active by the end of 2019.

5. Expenditure:

- i. In the financial year 2018-19 the total expenditure is close to the expenditure of the year 2017-18 i.e. 29 Cr.
- ii. The efficiency of DC and DDC appointed at NRM has increased from 60% to 75% in the year 2018-19 compared to the year 2014 and 2015.

6. In Geo tagging the performance of the Lohardaga district is excellent i.e. 93-94%. Also, high degree of Geo tagging will help in elimination of a scheme if taken up again, as the work can't be same for the similar work at same time.

Recommendations:

1. There is a need to prepare a report mentioning work distribution among SC and ST under the MG NREGA scheme.
2. The wages of MG-NREGA in-charge may be enhanced to commensurate with their responsibility as wages are too low to command in respect of his subordinates.
3. In the year 2015-16, only 2879 families were given 100 man days which is a best figure in the last 5 years. It is, therefore suggested that families getting 100 days (full employment) be raised to at least Rs. 5000/- as against more than 47, 667 families having Active cards in the district.
4. There is a need to make appropriate assessment of the administrative expenditures in the current financial year 2019-20 in comparison last 5 years.

Dr Vinod Aggarwal, IAS (Retd.)
MBBS (AIIMS) PGDGM (Geriatric Medicine)
Special Rapporteur for Central Zone,
9910093988 (mobile)

82/JS (P&T)
31/1/20

Dated 24th Jan, 2020

Dear Shri Jaideep,

Please refer to letter dated 24/12/19 by which a tour program for Jharkhand was submitted and was approved on same day, by the letter no 16/1/2019/Coord.

The report-1, is after discussion with State MG NREGA Commissioner about the scheme, as it is being run in the state. The report is from p 1-7, and annexure to the report on a a proforma designed by undersigned to get a better reflection of the program. The report submitted by State MG NREGA Commissioner is from p 8- 16.

Report-2, is after discussion and field visit to MG NREGA scheme in Lohardaga district. The report is from p 17-20, and annexure to the report on a proforma designed by undersigned to get a better examination of the program. The report submitted by DDC is from p 21- 25.

Report-3, is is after discussion and field visit to MG NREGA scheme in Khunti district. The report is from p 26-30, annexure to the report on a proforma designed by undersigned to get a better examination of the program. The report submitted by DDC is from p 31-39.

The report-4, is after discussion and meeting with all BDOs about the MG NREGA scheme in Koderma district. The report is from p 40-46, and annexure to the report on a proforma designed by undersigned to get a better examination of the program. The report submitted by DDC is from p.47-57.

The report-5, is after discussion with officers dealing with MG NREGA district of Ranchi. The report is from p 58-63, and

① Bhavesh — Pl. update list.

② Ms. S.P & K.P. —

[Signature]
4.2.20

[Handwritten notes]
28/1/20
JS (P&T)
31.1.20
The subject is being dealt by SRO of DL Section
MD
SPO 3/2
Rd/BL

annexure to the report on a a proforma designed by undersigned
to get a better incite of the program. The report submitted by
Ranchi is from 64-70.

The recommendations in each report are given separately, which
may be perused for further action.

with regards

Yours Sincerely

Vinod Aggarwal

Dr Vinod Aggarwal

Shri Jaideep Govind
Secretary General,
NHRC

Report 2, on Mahatma Gandhi National Rural Employment Guarantee Act (MG NREGA), in Lohardaga district of the state of Jharkhand by Dr. Vinod Aggarwal, Sp. Rapporteur, NHRC on 10th Jan, 2020.

The implementation of this rural employment scheme was examined in the district of Lohardaga on 10th Jan, 20. The population of the district is about 0.461 million. It is mainly rural district with 13 % population is urban & 0.404 million population is rural. The 3.4% population belongs to SC and 56.89 % are ST. In the area about 15330 SC and 262734 ST live and also there are 9127 rural households, who are agricultural laborers. The number of marginal farmers, as per district agricultural data, is 38528 families. The number of small farmers as per district agricultural data, is 7903 families. Even many of these small cultivators, sometimes there is not enough work, in their own fields, and they may also like to take up work under MG NREGA. In this district although there are many Alumina mines, but still large rural population, is still dependent on work in MG NREGA to keep the wage rate stable.

Number of registered families with family job cards is 68723 in 2014, which increased marginally to 73597 in 2018. The active job cards were 63813 in 2014 which got reduced to 47667 in 2018. Out of the families having the job card made, 93% job cards were active in 2014, but now only 65% are and done work for at least one day in the previous year. In the current financial year the man days employment has been provided for 13.68 lakh man days, against which the proportionate target till January, 20 is 10.51 lakh man days. For population of 4 lakh, this target of 1.36 million man days seems low but satisfactory. If 100 man days are given to 13600 families can be fully satisfied. It is felt that man days target of less than 2 million man days may give job guarantee slightly larger number of agricultural laborers. The district has 7 blocks and till the date of visit, 6.89 lakh man days (66%) of the proportionate target were created in the current year. Out of total man days generated the ST have done 427744 man days which is about 62% of total man days. The population of STs 57% and contribution to man days by this weaker section is about 62%. This suggests that without fixing the target, the STs have got 8-9% more man days per head. Similarly SCs constitute 3.4% rural population but have got 5% man days. They are also getting higher man days automatically, to the tune of about 50%. The district authorities have no data about the employment given to the agricultural land less laborers and marginal farmers.

The disturbing feature of the district MG NREGA is that the district has not gone beyond 83% of the target in any year in last 6 years although they were able to achieve at least 75% all of the years. In the year of 2018, there were reasons of strike for not achieving the target but otherwise not achieving the target in a poor

able to achieve at least 75% all of the years. In the year of 2018, there were reasons of strike for not achieving the target but otherwise not achieving the target in a poor district. In the year 18-19, the achievement remained at 75% only. The performance of various blocks in achievement of man-days varied from 71 to 82% and no one is too down below or too much to brag about. On the point of timely payment 77% of the payment is Aadhaar based in the year 2018-19. The reason seems to be that 87% of the Aadhaar linked cards are verified. Thus 63997 cards are Aadhaar verified out of 73195 cards which are linked to Aadhaar. On timely payment in 18-19, 90% of wages have been paid within 8 days of generation of muster roll. The 8% payment has been released in 15 days. Therefore only 2% of wages has gone beyond 15 days. The cases where payment has not been released within 15 days must be examined by senior officers. Kisko and Bandara block has done very well who has done about 97% in 8 days and 2-3% in 15 days. Overall Kuru block was too much behind where 7% people have got their wages after 15 days and the local officers may be taken to task.

In the financial year 18-19 the total expenditure is of 29 Cr rupee, which is almost same as 17-18. The DC and DDC pointed at NRM work increased in 18-19 to 77%, which was earlier at a slightly lower level than 60% in the years of 2014, 2015 and 2018. In the pendency of the schemes the district has shown a poor performance especially in the year of 2013-16 when very few schemes got completed. 13407 schemes were taken up from 2013 to 2018 and out of them 10809 schemes remained incomplete. There need to be a major drive for completion of pending schemes and some sort of embargo on taking up of new schemes is required

In Geo tagging the performance of the district is excellent and generally above 93-94%. High degree of geo-tagging will help in elimination a scheme being taken again, because the place can't be same for to similar work at one site.

Recommendations:

1. The rural population of the district is quite big and STs in rural area are 2.63 lakhs and constitute 56% population of the district. The active cards are 47667 look reasonable, but a certificate from all SC, ST, and rural land less families in the district may be obtained whether they are getting sufficient work under MG NREGA or not? Now a stage has come when we should start finding from the beneficiaries whether they are ready to work or not.
2. The district administration gave information of 2879 families been given 100 days in 15-16 as a best figure in last 5 years, for the families getting full 100 days employment. It is felt that this figure should

- touch 5000 families as active card holder families are more than 47667 families, seeking employment from the district in last 5 years.
3. Administrative expenditure is within 6%. In the year 2013-14, it has been reported less than 0.6% which doesn't seem correct. This was asked of them but no plausible reason was given for such a low expenditure. The wages of the Block in charge of NREGA program is too low to command the respect from Class 3 staff (PanchayatSevak) and others. It is strongly felt that, even if these are on contract, their salary should be more respectful and commensurate their responsibility.
 4. When Aadhaar verification is quite high of 87% and the Aadhaar payment is reasonable at about 77%. The reasons informed by the DC is that there are more than one account opened for the beneficiary and the system finally captures only one of those accounts and if the beneficiary has more accounts and funds gets transferred in any one of the accounts, than it is not reflected in the Aadhaar based payment, there is an issue that needs investigation so that all the accounts of the beneficiary should be reflected or the money be transferred in the earmarked account only. It seems some sort of software changes are required for which a higher level inter action is required.
 5. The number of incomplete works is about 51% as on 31-3-2019. In Senha block the % of incomplete works increases to 61% and in Lohardaga block, the pending works are 32% only. It is required that the administration conducts an audit and see that schemes more than 3 years old are either completed or foreclosed on an early date or in the current financial year 2019-20.
 6. It is prescribed that 60% expenditure should be due on NRM (Natural Resource Management), but in financial reports of 3 years it was not reflected. In the district the NRM works expenditure in last 5, for 3 years work account for more than 60%. It may be explained by the district authorities. About the percentage of expenditure is being maintained or not and NRM expenditure should remain between 58-62% over the years not as wide a variation as seen.
 7. The man day target of 1.3 million seems to be reasonable but needs increase to 2 million and at least 5000 families should complete 100 days of employment. But district has not achieved the mandays target even once in last 5-6 years, therefore it is felt that the target raising has to be based on

further assessment of the capacity of the personal and it seems the rate are low in MG NREGA, which may not be encouraging for workers to work whole heartedly.

8. The wages given under MG NREGA be increased so that there ratio is maintained at the same differential from minimum wages in the area, which was about 5 years back. That will also encourage more workers to come forward for MG NREGA works.

U/23/1/20
Dr Vinod Aggarwal
Special Rapporteur

Enclosed a report submitted by district administration in p- 1- 5

Report for Review of MGNREGA
Dr. Vinod Aggarwal, Special Rapporteur, NHRC, New Delhi
(Dist-Lohardaga, Date- 10.01.2020)

1. Population of the district as per 2011 census=**461790**
MGNREGA Mandays generation target for the current financial year= **1368213**
Proportionate target till Jan 2020 = **1051349**
2. Population of the rural area as per 2011 census =**404379**
(No financial target has been fixed)
3. The achievement against target of Mandays generation for the current financial year till date for the district =**689051**
4. The achievement against target of Mandays generation for the current financial year, till date, in terms of %, for the district = **65.54%**
5. Population of the district as per 2011 census = **461790**
Population of SC in the rural area= **15330**
(No Target is fixed in mandays)
33691 mandays generated in the current financial year till date for SC. (5%)
6. Population of the district as per 2011 census= **461790**.
Population of ST in the rural area=**262734**.
(No Target is fixed in mandays)
427744 mandays generated in the current financial year till date for ST. (62.08%)
6. Population of the district as per 2011 census= **461790**
Population of Land less labours in the district in the rural area=**9127 House Holds (As per SECC 2011 online data)**
(No Target is fixed in mandays)
8. Population of the district as per 2011 census= **461790**
Population of Marginal farmers in the district in the rural area=**38528 (As per Dist. Agriculture office data)**
(No Target is fixed in mandays)
9. Population of the district as per 2011 census= **461790**
Population of Small farmers in the district in the rural area=**7903 (As per Dist. Agriculture office data)**
(No Target is fixed in mandays)

10. Population of the Women in the district as per 2011 census in the rural Area=201124

315786 mandays generated in the current financial year till date for Women (45.83 %)

11. Payment of wages in the district and effect of MG NREGA in increasing the wages of labor over last 15 years.the report in following comparatives may be furnished

Year	Annual in Million Mandays			Job cards in No.			Cards Aadhaar in No.		
	Target	Achievement	%	Issued	Active	%	linked	Verified	%
2014	1227000	1015034	83%	68723	63813	93%	54717	51227	94%
2015	1504076	1203174	80%	69224	57026	82%	55622	52337	94%
2016	1620239	1268213	78%	72177	46638	65%	71743	70426	98%
2017	1458217	1091228	75%	72371	47575	66%	67304	65892	98%
2018	1368213	1028895	75%	73597	47667	65%	73195	63997	87%

12. Timely Payment

Year	Timely (with in 15 /8days & Aadhaar Based Payment in number of man-days							
	Total Mandays	Total Transaction	in 15 days	%	in 8 days	%	Aadhaar based	%
2014	1015034	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
2015	1203174	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
2016	1268213	205543	42948	21%	150833	73%	51222	68.83%
2017	1091228	187652	28571	15%	153023	82%	59664	85.86%
2018	1028895	185205	15052	8%	166980	90%	58439	77.43%

14. Number of families given 100 days or lesser employment as per job cards

Year	Number of families given 100 days or lesser employment as per job cards				
	Active Job cards	Total man-days	Average man-days/ job card	Families given 100 days e mployment in a year	% families having 100 days
2014	63813	1015034	16	1643	6%
2015	57026	1203174	21	2879	11%
2016	74421	1268213	17	1089	3%
2017	69487	1091228	16	1076	4%
2018	70321	1028895	15	855	3%

15. The report for financial year 2018-19

Block name	Annual in Million Mandays			Job cards in No.			Cards Aadhaar in No.		
	Target	Achievement	%	Issued	Active	%	linked	Verified	%
Bhandra	179749.7	136412	76%	9855	6655	68%	8840	7312	83%
Kairo	149324.1	121756	82%	7081	4807	68%	8561	7153	84%
Kisko	216551.3	154273	71%	10353	6821	66%	10732	9619	90%
Kuru	230433.4	172000	75%	16254	9401	58%	14313	12381	87%
Lohardaga	194275.1	141465	73%	11258	6929	62%	11319	10160	90%
Peshrar	153843.82	109511	71%	5833	4272	73%	5966	5275	88%
Senha	244035.37	193478	79%	12963	8782	68%	13464	12097	90%
TOTAL	1368213	1028895	75%	73597	47667	65%	73195	63997	87%

16. Timely Payment (2018-19)

Block name	Timely (with in 15 /8days & Aadhaar Based Payment in number of man-days							
	Total Mandays	Total Transaction	in 15 days	%	in 8 days	%	Aadhaar based	%
Bhandra	179750	23486	584	2%	22884	97%	6567	72%
Kairo	149324	21496	4611	21%	16713	78%	6221	70%
Kisko	216551	30111	960	3%	29128	97%	8916	80%
Kuru	230433	30425	3425	11%	25067	82%	11330	76%
Lohardaga	194275	26633	1817	7%	24440	92%	9416	81%
Peshrar	153844	18190	1156	6%	16910	93%	4602	76%
Senha	244035	34864	2499	7%	31838	91%	11387	83%
TOTAL	1368213	185205	15052	8%	166980	90%	58439	77%

17. No of schemes pending and completion along with % of Geo-tagging in No.

Year	No of schemes pending and completion along with % of Geo-tagging in No.								
	Pending on day-1	New	Total	Completed	%	Pending on last day of the year	Current status of pendency	Geo-tagged	
								No	%
2014	1151	1843	2994	279	9.32%	2715	-	11142	93.99%
2015	2715	1325	4040	189	4.68%	3851	-	12812	94.23%
2016	3851	5102	8953	888	9.92%	8065	105	15862	94.39%
2017	8065	6191	14256	4634	32.51%	9622	1557	19784	93.76%
2018	9622	3785	13407	2598	19.38%	10809	1187	20843	91.53%
Total	-	-	-	8588	-	-	2849	-	-

18. No of schemes pending and completion along with % of Geo-tagging in No. (2018-19)

Block Name	No of schemes pending and completion along with % of Geo-tagging in No.							Geotagged	
	Pending	New	Total	Completed	%	pending on last date	No	%	
	Bhandra	229	587	816	368	45%	219	2291	84.00
Kairo	164	332	496	230	46%	102	2076	92.00	
Kisko	154	407	561	306	55%	101	3752	95.00	
Kuru	534	828	1362	645	47%	183	4505	98.00	
Lohardaga	179	624	803	495	62%	129	2770	89.00	
Peshrar	56	339	395	196	50%	143	1804	73.00	
Senha	241	668	909	358	39%	310	3645	96.00	
TOTAL	1557	3785	5342	2598	49%	1187	20843	91.53	

19. Financial Report

Year	Financial in Rupee Crores			Administrative Exp.			NRM Expenditure		
	Target	Achieved	%	Target	Achieved	%	Target	Achieved	%
2014	-	26.841	-	-	0.1441	-	-	15.4839	-
2015	-	33.1093	-	-	1.0144	-	-	24.4801	-
2016	-	34.4236	-	-	1.6902	-	-	29.3216	-
2017	-	26.6142	-	-	1.4926	-	-	22.6352	-
2018	-	29.1478	-	-	1.2941	-	-	19.1697	-

20. Financial Report 2018-19

Block Name	Financial in Rupee Lakhs			Administrative Exp.			NRM Expenditure		
	Target	Achieved	%	Target	Achieved	%	Target	Achieved	%
Bhandra	-	377.38	-	-	21.13	-	-	233.04	64.62
Kairo	-	357.86	-	-	17.66	-	-	115.23	96.01
Kisko	-	411.18	-	-	15.61	-	-	418.43	83.97
Kuru	-	516.61	-	-	17.62	-	-	435.73	76.3
Lohardaga	-	393.39	-	-	19.71	-	-	268.7	69.68
Peshrar	-	294.41	-	-	12.92	-	-	28.85	74.97
Senha	-	559.02	-	-	19.82	-	-	416.99	83.5
TOTAL	-	2909.85	-	-	124.47	-	-	1916.97	77.5

21. Based on 15,16, 18 and 20 points rating of various blocks and corrective taken by the district administration in 2018-19.


Sl no	Block	PD %	Active JOB CARD %	Adhar Seeding %	Payment in 15 days %	Payment in 8 days %	DBT %	Scheme completion %	Geo tagging %	NRM Exp. %	Performance Average
1	Kisko	71.00	66.00	90.00	3.00	97.00	80.00	55.00	95.00	83.97	71.22
2	Kairo	82.00	68.00	84.00	21.00	78.00	70.00	46.00	92.00	96.01	70.78
3	Senha	73.00	68.00	90.00	7.00	91.00	83.00	39.00	96.00	83.50	70.06
4	Lohardaga	73.00	62.00	90.00	7.00	92.00	81.00	62.00	89.00	69.68	69.52
5	Kuru	75.00	58.00	87.00	11.00	82.00	76.00	47.00	98.00	76.30	67.81
6	Peshrar	71.00	73.00	88.00	6.00	93.00	76.00	50.00	73.00	74.97	67.22
7	Bhandra	76.00	68.00	83.00	2.00	97.00	72.00	45.00	84.00	64.62	65.74

22.SC/ST/Women Employment Status

FY	No. of Persondays generated					% of Persondays generated		
	SCs	STs	Others	Total	Women	SCs	STs	Women
2014-15	46587	744082	224365	1015034	419121	5%	73.31%	41.29%
2015-16	50823	912333	239814	1202970	507478	4%	75.84%	42.19%
2016-17	59350	876744	332119	1268213	575728	5%	69.13%	45.40%
2017-18	50836	673198	367194	1091228	510708	5%	61.69%	46.80%
2018-19	50836	673198	367194	1091228	510708	5%	61.69%	46.80%
2019-20	33691	427744	227616	689051	315786	5%	62.08%	45.83%

23. Performance of Blocks in 2019-20

Sl no.	Block	PD %	Adhar %	Payment in 15 days %	Payment in 8 days %	DBT %	Scheme completion %	Geo tagging %	NRM Exp. %	Performance Average
1	Senha	82.00	97.82	0.40	99.60	83.00	26.43	95.00	77.63	70.24
2	Kairo	55.00	96.03	0.62	99.38	70.00	26.74	91.00	95.71	66.81
3	Peshrar	80.00	98.43	0.17	99.83	76.00	17.07	69.00	84.40	65.61
4	Kisko	59.00	96.62	0.28	99.72	80.00	9.38	94.00	69.00	63.50
5	Kuru	60.00	96.40	0.23	99.77	76.00	26.67	98.00	47.81	63.11
6	Lohardaga	58.00	97.59	0.20	99.80	81.00	11.87	88.00	58.46	61.87
7	Bhandra	63.00	96.47	0.04	99.96	72.00	16.51	81.00	49.66	59.83
Total		65.54	97	0.28	99.72	77.3	20.4	89.87	65.03	-


 BDC-qum-DPC,
 MGNREGA, Lohardaga.

25(5)